



July 25, 2014

TO: Katie Levy, Environmental Planner, SANDAG

FROM: David Hogan, Director, TCLC

SUBJECT: FINAL REPORT for Proctor Valley Vehicle Barriers Project

This document serves as the final report on the The Chaparral Lands Conservancy's (TCLC) *Proctor Valley Vehicle Barriers Project* in accordance with the conditions of TransNet EMP FY 2011 Grant Agreement 5001971 and amendments. This report addresses the period from April 1, 2014 to June 30, 2014 and provides a closing summary of work completed for the entire project.

## **Summary**

Work on the Proctor Valley Vehicle Barriers Project (Project) was successfully completed during this period. Despite setbacks – delayed release of matching funds, and significantly increased construction costs from the time of the EMP grant application and agreement to the time of construction – all necessary funding was obtained and a greater distance of vehicle barriers was constructed than that required in the EMP grant agreement. The Project ultimately installed 2.7 miles of new barriers along Proctor Valley Road to prevent off-road vehicle activity in a large preserve area. The new vehicle barriers close several gaps and extend the length and effectiveness of several miles of previously constructed barriers. The Project also included two large, attractive Proctor Valley entrance signs.

Work during this last reporting period included completion of construction of two large valley entrance signs and grant reporting and administration. Work completed over the course of the Project and conducted during this period under each Project task is described below.

## **Environmental Review and Permitting (Task 1)**

Environmental review and permitting over the course of the Project included all work necessary to conduct environmental review and to secure all required permits and authorizations for the Project. These activities were organized and conducted by TCLC staff except as noted below and included the following:



- Preparation of a Project description and maps;
- A site visit with City of San Diego staff to identify possible Proctor Valley entrance sign locations
- Discussion of possible entrance sign locations, text, and design with resource agency and Otay Ranch staff.
- Research to identify any permitting requirements;
- Arrangements with (and assistance to) the California Department of Fish and Wildlife (CDFW) for their preparation of a Notice of Exemption under the California Environmental Quality Act;
- Preparation of a contract for cultural resource surveys and a report by Recuerdos Research;
- Site visits to refine the Project description and location and to meet with CDFW staff and Recuerdos Research;
- Cultural resource surveys and a report documenting results by Recuerdos Research; and
- Preparation of right-of-entry permits to access Otay Ranch property for Project construction including the northern entrance sign, and City of San Diego property for construction of the southern entrance sign.

Of note during the process of environmental review and permitting was the extent to which the Otay Ranch right-of-entry permit became more complicated and time consuming than anticipated due to the late addition of new contract conditions by the company.

Environmental review and permitting expenses over the course of the Project included TCLC staff time and travel to conduct all of the above activities organized and conducted by TCLC as well as the cost of the cultural resources survey and report. The actual cost of the cultural resources survey and report were ultimately significantly lower than those in the original EMP grant agreement, and the CEQA NOE was prepared by CDFW at no cost to TCLC. As such, SANDAG approved an amended grant agreement allowing the balance of these funds to be reallocated to pay higher costs for vehicle barrier construction, some costs of insurance required by Otay Ranch, SANDAG, and TNC, and to supplement TCLC staff time.

Environmental review and permitting was completed prior to the last reporting period.

## **Vehicle Barriers Installation (Task 2)**

The Project ultimately installed 14,028ft (2.7 miles) of new steel pipe vehicle barriers along Proctor Valley Road on Otay Ranch private property to prevent off-road vehicle activity in a large preserve area bisected by the road. The new barriers protect preserve lands and resources like vernal pools by closing several gaps and extending the length and effectiveness of several miles of vehicle barriers that were

built previously by the City of San Diego and California Department of Fish and Wildlife. The new barriers have effectively blocked off-road vehicle access to several sites that had previously been used for trash dumping, parties, and target shooting, one of which was the location of ignition of a 2012 wildfire that threatened Jamul.



Vehicle barriers installation work was organized by TCLC with construction conducted by Alpine Fence and included the following:

- Preparation of a contract with The Nature Conservancy for matching funds;
- Soliciting and reviewing bids for construction of the vehicle barriers;
- Site visits to familiarize contract bidders with the Project design and location;
- Selecting a contractor for construction of the vehicle barriers. Three bids were solicited with Alpine Fence providing the lowest bid and best assurances of construction quality and completion;
- Negotiation and preparation of a construction contract with Alpine Fence;
- Dig Alert coordination and site markings;
- Construction of approximately 14,028ft (2.7 miles) of vehicle barriers, .6 miles more than the 2.1 miles of barriers required by the EMP grant agreement; and

- Property line survey near Jamul to confirm placement of the barriers on Otay Ranch property subject to the entry permit.



Several items were of note for installation of the vehicle barriers:

- The Nature Conservancy experienced a significant administrative delay in providing matching funds. This in turn necessitated a schedule extension amendment to the EMP grant agreement and delayed the contract with the fencing contractor.
- Vehicle barrier construction costs significantly increased from the time of the EMP grant application and agreement to the time of the construction contract.
- Total vehicle barrier costs also increased as the result of a decision to extend the barriers an additional .6 mile to a more effective end point.
- Alpine Fence completed quality vehicle barriers on schedule and implemented all contract conditions with notable diligence and professionalism.
- A property line survey was conducted in response to an allegation from an adjacent property owner that the vehicle barriers were constructed on her property. Contact with the property owner began earlier with a complaint to TCLC that the barriers would block horseback access from her property onto that owned by Otay Ranch. The property owner's request for horse gates in the barriers was forwarded to Otay Ranch but permission was denied. The property owner



then resorted to an allegation that the barriers had been constructed on her property. The property line survey confirmed the correct and permitted location of the barriers on adjacent Otay Ranch property.

- A press release by TCLC generated a very positive news story on the Project by 10News.

Vehicle barrier installation expenses over the course of the Project included construction of the barriers, survey materials to mark the project location for a utilities dig alert, and the cost of insurance required as conditions of City of San Diego and Otay Ranch property right-of-entry permits, the matching funds contract with The Nature Conservancy, and the EMP grant agreement. Expenses also included TCLC staff time and travel for preparation and finalization of the Alpine Fence contract and the Otay Ranch right-of-entry permit, coordination and preparation for the utilities dig alert, and oversight of barriers construction and the property line survey. Increased vehicle barrier construction costs were borne by SANDAG with an amended EMP grant agreement, and through a larger contribution of matching funds by the Center for Biological Diversity and The Nature Conservancy.

Vehicle barriers installation was completed prior to the last reporting period.

### **Public Outreach (Task 3)**

The Project included public outreach work in the form of construction of two large, attractive Proctor Valley entrance signs at the northern and southern entrances to the valley on Proctor Valley Road. The signs accomplish the practical purpose of communicating to passerby the existence of preserve lands and assisting law enforcement by clearly communicating prohibited activities. The signs communicate a strong sense that Proctor Valley is a well-managed and protected place deserving of respect rather than a lawless no-man's land suitable only for trash dumping, off-roading, and other abuse.

Preparation and installation of the entrance signs included the following activities:

- Solicitation and receipt of sign design input from Proctor Valley preserve property owners including the California Department of Fish and Wildlife, City of San Diego Public Utilities Department, Otay Ranch, and U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.
- Volunteer sign design by Vicki Estrada, President of Estrada Land Planning with review by TCLC staff;
- Professional preparation of sign text, animal, and logo elements by sign contractor Sign Distinction;
- Installation of sign posts by Alpine Fence; and
- Transportation and installation of signs by TCLC staff and volunteers.



Public outreach / entrance sign expenses over the course of the Project included the cost of preparation of sign elements by the sign contractor, the cost of several telephone pole sign posts, and work by Alpine Fence to install the posts. Expenses also included TCLC staff time and travel for sign design, consultation with agency property owners, identification of sign locations, sign installation, and travel.

Public outreach / entrance signs work was completed during the last reporting period.

#### **Grant Reporting and Administration (Task 4)**

Grant reporting and administration expenses over the course of the Project included TCLC staff time to track and record expenses and for preparation of EMP grant invoices and reports.

#### **Project Schedule**

The Project has been completed on schedule in accordance with the amended EMP grant agreement.



## **Project Budget**

The Project was completed slightly under budget for EMP funds in accordance with the EMP Grant Agreement Amendment 2. The total Project cost exceeded the EMP Grant Amendment 2 total Project budget by \$102,182 primarily due to the increased cost of vehicle barrier materials, an additional year of insurance costs resulting from Project delays, and a decision to extend the barriers an additional .6 mile to a more effective end point. Matching funds to pay for increased total Project costs have been provided by the Center for Biological Diversity and The Nature Conservancy.

Project expenditures have been detailed in invoices #1 through #9 submitted previously, and Invoice #10, submitted separately.

Thank you for your consideration. Please direct any questions to David Hogan at 619 756-3864 or [director@chaparralconservancy.org](mailto:director@chaparralconservancy.org).

###